

**Cross Purposes: Bringing together God's love and God's justice in Jesus Christ**

**Instructor:** David Eagle, Pastor, Saanich Community Church

**Institution:** Christian Community College, Victoria, British Columbia

**Course Times:** Monday nights from 7:00 – 10:00pm

**Course Dates:** February 7 to March 28<sup>th</sup>, 2005 (8 weeks, 9 lectures, 27 hours of instruction)

**Location:** Pacific Christian Secondary School, at the end of Agnes Street

**Additional Session:** Guest Lecture with Dr. Hans Boersma, Saturday, March 12<sup>th</sup>, 2005, 1-4pm.

**Location:** Saanich Community Church, 4566 W Saanich Road

AVAILABLE AS AN AUDIT OR A 2 or 3 CREDIT COURSE THROUGH CAREY THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY – the requirements are outlined below for those taking the course for 2 or 3 credits.

*Instructor Biography*

David Edwin Eagle is pastor of Saanich Community Church. He holds a Master of Divinity degree from Mennonite Brethren Biblical Seminary in Fresno, CA and a Bachelor of Science in Mechanical Engineering from the University of Alberta. David's thesis, *Jesus, Eh? The Saving Significance of the Cross, the Hermeneutics of John D. Caputo and the Canadian Context*, explored the atonement in conversation with contemporary philosophy. David has taught as a sessional instructor at Fresno Pacific University and Mennonite Brethren Biblical Seminary. David is married to Alison and has a son, Joshua.

*Description*

Throughout the history of the church, she has wrestled with many difficult and seemingly paradoxical ideas such as "How can one God be Father, Son and Holy Spirit?" or "How can Christ be human and also divinely exalted?" This course will examine another of these seeming paradoxes: "How can God be both **lover** and **judge**? Or in other words: "How do we deal with God's justice and anger in light of God's love?" While this theme is important throughout the Bible, nowhere in the Bible is this issue more clearly embodied than by Jesus and his work on the cross.

This seminar will examine in detail:

1. Moving beyond *paradoxical* understandings of God's love versus God's justice/anger into a biblically informed *synthesis* of these two aspects of God's character. Specifically we will examine this synthesis as it relates to:
  - a. How Christ through his life, death and resurrection saves us
  - b. The extent of Christ's salvation to those who are not followers of Christ
2. We will consider these questions as expressed in biblical, historical and contemporary contexts.

Additionally, special attention will be given to the implications arising out of different ways of understanding the nature and the extent of the work of Jesus for the life of the church and its witness.

### *Online Component*

This course has an online component located at: [crosspurposes.typepad.com](http://crosspurposes.typepad.com). Here the instructor will post weekly reflections, and there will be opportunity for students to interact and discuss in this forum. The site also contains the course materials (hand-outs, syllabus, and bibliography) and links to related/supplemental material.

### *Required Texts (232 pages):*

- Baker, Mark and Joel Green. *Recovering the Scandal of the Cross*. Downers Grove: IVP, 2000.

### *Additional Required Reading (handed out in class, 135 pages):*

- Selections from:
  - Driver, John. *Understanding the Atonement for the Mission of the Church*. Scottsdale: Herald Press, 1986.
  - Baker, Mark. *Religious No More*. Downers Grove: IVP, 1999.
  - Boersma, Hans. *Violence, Hospitality and the Cross*. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2004.
  - Anselm, *Cur Deus Homo*; Abelard, *The Epistle to the Romans*
  - Various other articles – see schedule

### *Additional Required Texts for Credit Students (2 unit students read 1 of the following, 3 unit students read both): (544 pages)*

- Sanders, John. *No Other Name: An Investigation into the Destiny of the Unevangelized*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1992.

### *And choose one of the following (200-300 pages, one of):*

- Alison, James. *Raising Abel: A Recovery of Eschatological Imagination*. New York: Herder & Herder, 1996.
- Bartlett, Anthony W. *Cross Purposes: The Violent Grammar of Christian Atonement*. Harrisburg, PA: Trinity, 2001.
- Boersma, Hans. *Violence, Hospitality and the Cross: Reappropriating the Atonement Tradition*. Grand Rapids; Baker, 2004.
- Friesen, Chris. *Reconsidering Hell*. Mennonite Brethren Biblical Seminary Master's Thesis, 2003.
- Ray, Darby Kathleen. *Deceiving the Devil*. Toronto: Pilgrim Press, 1998.
- Schwager, Raymund. *Jesus in the Drama of Salvation: Toward a Doctrine of Redemption*. New York: Herder & Herder, 1999.
- Sherman, Robert J. ed. *The Glory of the Atonement*, T&T Clark, 2004. (selections – see instructor)
- Weaver, J. Denny. *The Non-Violent Atonement*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001.

### *Three unit students read the following:*

- Schwager, Raymund. *Jesus in the Drama of Salvation: Toward a Doctrine of Redemption*. New York: Herder & Herder, 1999. (you may skim the following pages: 44-52, 69-79, 96-112, 119-135).

### *Objectives*

This class, through readings, discussion, and personal reflection, will challenge students to think biblically and theologically about the nature and extent of the work of Christ.

#### **1. The Nature of the Work of Christ (Atonement Theories) – 90%**

The predominant understanding of the work of Christ in evangelical circles is what is termed penal substitution. We will examine in detail this theory and its historical development. We will explore the problems associated with this image and attempting a synthesis of God's love and God's justice. We will then explore and evaluate other ways in which the Church has conceptualized the work of Jesus on the cross throughout history. The goal is to help students recognize the problems with penal substitution and gain a greater appreciation for the variety of contextually relevant atonement metaphors and images that the church has developed. Not all atonement theories are equally biblical, or contextually relevant. But, by the end of the class students should be able to critically evaluate different atonement theories from biblical, theological, and contextual perspectives. The goal is to challenge students to more fully understand and embrace the redemptive work of Christ and analyze the implications for the church and its mission, the different ways of explaining the work of Christ.

#### **2. Extent of the Atonement (Destiny of the Unevangelized) – 10%**

In a world where the church has been radically marginalized, and where we share a country with people with many different religious beliefs, the question of the extent of Christ's salvation to the non-Christian has become hotly contested. With this question, we are again confronted with the seeming paradox of God's love and God's justice. God's love seems to dictate that everyone should be saved, God's justice seems to dictate that some should suffer for their sins. We will explore the major ways of dealing with this question that have been proposed by Christians, and evaluate whether these approaches offer a synthetic approach to God's love and God's justice, while at the same time making sense of the Biblical material. At the same time, the goal is to help students appreciate that there are several biblically supported, evangelical options in dealing with this question, namely, inclusivism, restrictivism, and divine perseverance. And finally, students will be challenge to wrestle with the missiological implications of the different ways of understanding the extent of the work of Christ.

#### **3. End Goal**

The overarching goal of this class is to help students confess and appropriate a theological understanding of the nature of the work of Jesus that is grounded in Scripture, effective in the life of the Church, and consistent with God's mission in the world.

### *Learning Activities and Assignments*

1. *Prepare for, attend, and participate in class discussions.* The course schedule, listed below, contains a listing of the readings to be completed prior to each

class session. Students are expected to purchase *Green and Baker*, and *Sanders*. Other materials will be distributed to students in photocopied form. Because this class will centre on discussion, it is imperative that students prepare to contribute their discoveries, evaluations, questions, concerns, and reflexions to class discussion. This is an important part of the educational experience and is critical for the development of a healthy learning community.

**For extra enrichment:**

2. *Develop your own metaphor, parable or picture of the atonement.* This “paper” can be in the form of a story, song, or drama, as long as it achieves the stated goals. The goal of this assignment is to create a 600-800 word (if a written format is used) metaphor/image of the atonement. This metaphor should connect with your particular context, while at the same time challenge your context (see *Green & Baker, 113-115*). You can think of this assignment as creating an evangelistic tract, or part of a conversation with someone about the saving significance of the cross. In addition to the metaphor, you will include a one page summary that includes a description of your particular context, the ways in which this metaphor connects with the context and the ways in which this metaphor challenges the context.

**For 2 unit Credit Students:**

3. *Complete activity 2.*
4. *Prepare a 15 minute in-class presentation and facilitate a 10 minute discussion on the book you selected from the list of choices.* The presentation should introduce us to the key ideas in the book, and present a summary of how the author understands the saving significance of the cross. The presentation should wrap up with your evaluation of the author. Present both critique and affirmation. Plan to have about 10 minutes of discussion after your presentation. Presentation will be during the last class, on March 26<sup>th</sup>. Class presentations will include a single page handout summarizing your presentation. **DUE MARCH 26<sup>th</sup>.**
5. *Prepare a 250 word book reports on Sanders.* Pretend you are writing for a magazine, and summarize the argument of the book, and describe what you liked about the book and what you didn’t like about the book. **DUE APRIL 11<sup>th</sup>.**

6. *Destiny of the Unevangelized Assignment*. Based on your reading of Sanders, choose a position that most closely represents your own position on the subject (125 words). Then, prepare a short sermon or magazine article (625 words), based on a specific Scripture passage(s) that tries to convince the hearer/reader of your position. The goal of this assignment is to take the material from the scholarly/academic realm, into the realm of the everyday person all the while supporting your arguments Biblically. I want you to try and communicate complicated ideas in clear, understandable ways. That's the real work of theological education! **DUE APRIL 25<sup>th</sup>**.
7. *Write a 2500 word research paper that explores one of the following: DUE APRIL 25<sup>th</sup>*.
  - a. An in depth study of the doctrine of penal substitution and its development in the early Church Fathers, Anselm, medieval Catholicism, and its later incorporation into evangelicalism through Charles Hodge and others.
  - b. Explore how a particular theologian has dealt with the problem of God's love/God's justice in their theologies relating to the cross (see bibliography for suggested theologians). Please talk with instructor prior to selecting a particular theologian.
  - c. Compare atonement ideas in another religious tradition and compare and contrast it to the Christian atonement tradition.
  - d. An exploration and assessment of the contribution of Rene Girard to atonement thinking. Summarize the attempts by various theologians to make use of Rene Girard's mimetic theory and evaluate whether you find this work convincing. *Please see instructor for help with this topic.*
  - e. An exploration of the connections between the Resurrection and the Atonement. You will look at both the issue of its absence in some atonement theories and its importance in various others.
  - f. Investigate how various movies about Jesus (Passion of the Christ, Jesus of Montreal, The Gospel of John, The Last Temptation of Christ, etc) and other pop culture expressions about the cross (e.g. in U2's music) deal with the tension between God's love and God's justice. *Please talk with instructor prior to embarking on this topic.*
  - g. *Other topics with the permission of the instructor.*

**For 3 Unit Credit Students**

8. *Complete activity 2.*
9. *Complete activity 4.*
10. Prepare 1-250 word book report on Schwager. Pretend you are writing for a magazine, and summarize the argument of the book, and describe what you liked about the book and what you didn't like about the book. **DUE APRIL 11<sup>th</sup>**.
11. *Alternative Interpretation Exercise* - Since the penal satisfaction theory of the atonement is often taught as the explanation of the atonement, many of us have a hard time seeing anything else in some scripture passages. To imagine an

alternative interpretation of a passage does not necessarily mean penal satisfaction is wrong, but it at least opens space for discussion and evaluation. This assignment seeks to create that space.

- a. Each student will write a paraphrase of Romans 3:24 & 25 that clearly communicates a non-“penal satisfaction” interpretation of the text (specifically a non-penal satisfaction interpretation of words like: justified, redemption, sacrifice of atonement, justice, righteousness). You will substantiate that paraphrase with commentary on the principle themes of Romans 3:21-26 and notes on key translation and exegetical issues in verses 24 & 25 (750 words ss). You obviously will not be able to write fully developed arguments. What you write on this page should, however, point to the decisions you have made and give a sense of how you are substantiating that decision. You of course may not agree with or be convinced by your own paraphrase and commentary. If that is the case you may note where you disagree with the interpretation you offer, and why, or you may note where you still have questions. Use footnotes to acknowledge sources of ideas you borrow from others. **DUE APRIL 11<sup>th</sup>.**

12. *Destiny of the Unevangelized Assignment.* Based on your reading of Sanders, choose a position that most closely represents your own position on the subject (250 words). Then, prepare a short sermon or magazine article (2000 words), based on a specific Scripture passage(s) that tries to convince the hearer/reader of your position. The goal of this assignment is to take the material from the scholarly/academic realm, into the realm of the everyday person all the while supporting your arguments Biblically. I want you to try and communicate complicated ideas in clear, understandable ways. That’s the real work of theological education! **DUE APRIL 25<sup>th</sup>.**

13. *Complete activity 7, but the paper will be 5000 words.*

### **Course Load (2 units)**

Lecture, 9 lectures, 3hrs/lecture:	27 hours
Reading, 883 pages	30 hours
Writing Assignments, 17 pages	34 hours
Class Presentation	04 hours preparation
<b>Total Time</b>	<b>95 hours (2 units @ 45 hours/unit)</b>

### **Grading (2 units)**

Class Participation -	20%
Book Report-	05%
Class Presentation-	15%
Sermon/Article-	20%
Major Essay -	40%

### ***Course Load (3 units)***

Lecture, 9 lectures, 3hrs/lecture:	27 hours
Boersma Seminar	02 hours
Reading, 1112 pages	37 hours
Writing Assignments, 33 pages	66 hours
Class Presentation	04 hours preparation
<b>Total Time</b>	<b>136 hours (3 units @ 45 hours/unit)</b>

### ***Grading (3 units)***

Class Participation -	20%
Book Reports-	10%
Class Presentation-	10 %
Sermon/Article-	20%
Romans Assignment-	10%
Major Essay -	30%

### *Instructor's Commitment*

It is only fair that because the instructor has high expectations of the students, the students will also have high expectations of their instructors. Therefore the instructor will endeavour to:

1. Foster a positive learning environment where ideas can be expressed and explored freely without fear of ridicule or attack. Many people have pondered deeply the significance of the cross and come to very different conclusions. While some conclusions may be better or worse (at least in our opinion) they all deserve to be heard, discussed and evaluated.
2. Join with you in encountering the presence Jesus. The instructor does not have all the answers, and in fact is in process on many of these questions. The hope is that all of us together will be challenge to grow in our depth of understanding and appreciation for the work of Jesus Christ.
3. Provide helpful and careful feedback. It is the instructor's goal to help students think critically about the work of Christ. The instructor will challenge you to defend your ideas. The instructor will also be available during the week for one on one discussion.

### *Course Schedule*

**Class #1:** Introduction; Getting Acquainted; A Bi-Polar God: The Problem of Wrath and Mercy

**Date:** Monday, February 7<sup>th</sup>, 2005

**Reading to be completed prior to class:**

None

**Class #2:** Critiquing Penal Substitution; Review of Anselm; Christus Victor; and Moral Influence

**Date:** Monday, February 14<sup>th</sup>, 2005

**Reading to be completed prior to class:**

*Recovering the Scandal*, pp.11-34

*Recovering the Scandal*, pp. 116-152

Clark, David, "Why Did Christ Have to Die?" (handout) (2pp)

Anselm, "Cur Deus Homo" (available online) (19pp)

Abelard, Peter. "Exposition of Paul's Epistle to the Romans." (handout) (4pp)

**Class #3:** The Saving Significance of the Cross in the Synoptic Gospels, in Hebrews, 1 Peter and Johannine Writings

**Date:** Monday, February 21<sup>st</sup>, 2005

**Reading to be completed prior to class:**

*Recovering the Scandal*, pp. 35-46; 68-115.

Mouw, Richard, "Violence and the Atonement." *Books and Culture* Vol. 7, No. 1 (Jan/Feb 2001) p.12ff. (11pp)

Boersma, Hans, "The Disappearance of Punishment." *Books and Culture* (Mar/April 2003). (7pp)

Mathewes-Green, Frederica. "The Meaning of Christ's Suffering." *Books and Culture* Vol. 10, No. 2 (March/April 2004) p.28ff. (5pp)

**Class #4:** Thinking about Sin, Wrath, Law and Sacrifice: The Saving Significance of the Cross in Pauline Literature

**Date:** Monday, February 28<sup>th</sup>, 2005

**Reading to be completed prior to class:**

*Recovering the Scandal*, pp. 46-67.

*Religious No More*, Chapter 7, pp. 97-108 (handout)

Driver, "Justification," pp.197-204 (handout)

Gundry-Volf, Judith, "Expiation, Propitiation, Mercy Seat," in *Dictionary of Paul and His Letters*, pp. 279-283. (handout)

Hays, Richard. "Justification" in the *Anchor Bible Dictionary*. (3pp)

**Class #5:** Recent Innovations in Atonement Thinking: Jacques Derrida and Rene Girard

**Date:** Monday, March 7<sup>th</sup>, 2005

**Reading to be completed prior to class:**

Eagle, David, unpublished article (credit students only, 15pp)

Boersma, Hans, *Violence, Hospitality and the Cross*, pp.133-151. (handout)

Vanhoozer, Kevin. "Of Guilt, Goats, and Gifts." in Sherman, Robert J. ed. *The Glory of the Atonement*, T&T Clark, 2004. (25pp).

**Class #6:** Violence, Hospitality and the Cross

**Lecturer:** Dr. Hans Boersma, Trinity Western University/Regent College

**Date:** Saturday, March 12<sup>th</sup>, 1-4pm

**Location:** Saanich Community Church; 4566 W Saanich Road

**Reading to be completed prior to class:**

TBA

**Class #7:** Responding to Dr. Boersma, Exploring/Creating Alternate Metaphors

**Date:** Monday, March 14<sup>th</sup>, 2005

**Reading to be completed prior to class:**

*Recovering the Scandal, 153-221*

Baker, Mark, "Atonement: A Beach Parable for Youth" (2pp)

Friesen, Chris, "Atonement in the Coffee Shop (2pp)

**Class #8:** One Hell of a Subject: Exclusivism; Pluralism; Inclusivism

**Date:** Monday, March 21<sup>st</sup>, 2005

**Reading to be completed prior to class:**

TBA

**Class #9:** Class presentations, Wrap up.

**Date:** Monday, March 28<sup>th</sup>, 2005

**Reading to be completed prior to class:**

None.

**Optional Topics as time allows**

Missiological Implications

### *Bibliography*

#### Patristic and Historical Works

Abelard, Peter, *Exposition of Romans*. In *Readings in the History of Christian Thought*.

Ed., Robert L. Ferm. New York: Holt, Reinhart and Winston, 1964.

Allison, C.F. *The Cruelty of Heresy*. Harrisburg, PA: Morehouse, 1994.

Anselm, *Cur Deus Homo*. In *Readings in the History of Christian Thought*. Ed., Robert L.

Ferm. New York: Holt, Reinhart and Winston, 1964.

Aulen, Gustaf, *Christus Victor: An Historical Study of the Three Main Types of the Idea of the Atonement*. New York: MacMillan, 1966.

González, Justo, *Mañana: Christian Theology from a Hispanic Perspective*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1990.

Gregory of Nyssa, *The Great Catechism*. In *Readings in the History of Christian Thought*.

Ed., Robert L. Ferm. New York: Holt, Reinhart and Winston, 1964.

Irenaeus, *Proof of the Apostolic Preaching*. In *Ancient Christian Writers: The Works of the Fathers in Translation*. Vol. 16. Trans. J.P. Smith. New York: Newman Press, 1952.

Irenaeus, *Against Heresies*, Book 3. In *Ante-Nicene Christian Library: Translations of the Writings of the Fathers*, vol. 5. Eds., A. Roberts and J. Donaldson. Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1880.

Irenaeus, *Against Heresies*, Book 5. In *Library of Christian Classics*, vol. 1, *Early Christian Fathers*. Trans. and ed. C.C. Richardson. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1953.

Pelikan, Jaroslav. *The Christian Tradition: A History of the Development of Doctrine: The Emergence of the Catholic Tradition (100-600)*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1971.

#### Contemporary Works

Alison, James. *Raising Abel: A Recovery of Eschatological Imagination*. New York: Herder & Herder, 1996.

Bartlett, Anthony W. *Cross Purposes: The Violent Grammar of Christian Atonement*. Harrisburg, PA: Trinity, 2001.

Boersma, Hans. *Violence, Hospitality and the Cross: Reappropriating the Atonement Tradition*. Grand Rapids; Baker, 2004.

Borg, Marcus and N.T. Wright. *The Meaning of Jesus: Two Visions*. New York: HarperCollins, 1999.

Dillistone, F.W. *The Christian Understanding of the Atonement*. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1968.

Driver, John. *Understanding Atonement for the Mission of the Church*. Scottdale, PA: Herald Press, 1986.

Green, Joel and Mark Baker. *Recovering the Scandal of the Cross*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.

Hodge, Charles. *Systematic Theology*, vol. 2. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1952.

Kraus, C. Norman. *Jesus Christ our Lord: Christology from a Disciple's Perspective*, revised ed. Scottdale, PA: Herald Press, 1987, 1990.

Moltmann, Jurgen. *The Crucified God*. New York: Harper and Row, 1974.

Pannenberg, Wolfhart. *Jesus, God and Man*. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1968.

Placher, William. *The Meaning of Jesus Christ for Christian Faith*. Westminster John Knox, 2001.

Ray, Darby Kathleen. *Deceiving the Devil: Atonement, Abuse, and Ransom*. Cleveland, OH: Pilgrim Press, 1998.

Schwager, Raymund. *Jesus in the Drama of Salvation: Toward a Doctrine of Redemption*. New York: Herder & Herder, 1999.

Song, C.S. *Jesus & the Reign of God*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993.

Sobrinho, Jon. *Christology at the Crossroads*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1978.

Stott, John. *The Cross of Christ*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1986.

Weaver, J. Denny. *The Non-Violent Atonement*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001.

Weaver, J. Denny. *Keeping Salvation Ethical: Mennonite and Amish Atonement Theology in the Late Nineteenth Century*. Scottdale, PA: Herald Press, 1997.